

Message

From: Lambert, Jason [Lambert.Jason@epa.gov]
Sent: 6/19/2017 1:28:21 PM
To: Segal, Deborah [Segal.Deborah@epa.gov]; Wright, Michael [Wright.Michael@epa.gov]; Vandenberg, John [Vandenberg.John@epa.gov]; Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer [Richmond-Bryant.Jennifer@epa.gov]; Bahadori, Tina [Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov]
CC: D'Amico, Louis [DAmico.Louis@epa.gov]; Jones, Samantha [Jones.Samantha@epa.gov]; Gatchett, Annette [Gatchett.Annette@epa.gov]; Rice, Glenn [rice.glenn@epa.gov]; Thayer, Kris [thayer.kris@epa.gov]; Hawkins, Belinda [Hawkins.Belinda@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: Reyes and Price paper
Attachments: Reyes_MCR_abstract 04242017_Lambert edits.docx

Good morning everyone,

Sorry; a little late to this game. I also am not trying to throw wrenches but I feel compelled to at least pitch my 2 cents in. Mike Wright had asked me to take a look at this draft manuscript early last week, so I will go ahead and provide my comments here as things look to be moving fast. I will caveat my comments below with the fact that I recognize folks are trying to do the best they can with the information at hand (e.g., NHANES urine data and TDIs), however I do have some issues with the information used and the conclusions made. Please note these are pretty much the same items I discussed with Matt Lorber a long time ago re: cumulative risk of phthalates. And, for complete transparency I reviewed an abstract from Reyes et al. (I assume for a meeting) several weeks ago on the same topic; I have pasted my track changes copy of that abstract if anyone wants to see what was said previously on the topic.

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Otherwise, yes, this paper was reasonably well written.

Jason C. Lambert, PhD, DABT
U.S. EPA, ORD, NCEA
26 West Martin Luther King Dr.
Cincinnati, OH 45268
(513) 569-7078 ph.

(513) 487-2539 fax
lambert.jason@epa.gov

From: Segal, Deborah
Sent: Monday, June 19, 2017 8:47 AM
To: Wright, Michael <Wright.Michael@epa.gov>; Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>; Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer <Richmond-Bryant.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Bahadori, Tina <Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov>
Cc: D'Amico, Louis <DAmico.Louis@epa.gov>; Jones, Samantha <Jones.Samantha@epa.gov>; Gatchett, Annette <Gatchett.Annette@epa.gov>; Lambert, Jason <Lambert.Jason@epa.gov>; Rice, Glenn <rice.glenn@epa.gov>; Thayer, Kris <thayer.kris@epa.gov>; Hawkins, Belinda <Hawkins.Belinda@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Reyes and Price paper

Hello,

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Overall, I found this article interesting, informative and well-written.

Thanks!

Deb

From: Wright, Michael
Sent: Sunday, June 18, 2017 5:30 PM
To: Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>; Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer <Richmond-Bryant.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Bahadori, Tina <Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov>; Segal, Deborah <Segal.Deborah@epa.gov>
Cc: D'Amico, Louis <DAmico.Louis@epa.gov>; Jones, Samantha <Jones.Samantha@epa.gov>; Gatchett, Annette <Gatchett.Annette@epa.gov>; Lambert, Jason <Lambert.Jason@epa.gov>; Rice, Glenn <rice.glenn@epa.gov>; Thayer, Kris <thayer.kris@epa.gov>; Hawkins, Belinda <Hawkins.Belinda@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Reyes and Price paper

Tina et al:

Shortly after Jen sent this around, I asked two folks here with more risk assessment expertise than myself to provide a technical review of the paper in question, given its focus on mixtures (Glenn Rice and Jason Lambert) and phthalates (Jason). I pasted Glenn's input in blue below based on his review last week.

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

I cc'ed Kris here too but I know she was in the loop on this earlier dissemination.

I'll follow up with Jason tmrw when he's back in the office to see if he has anything further. They are cc'ed here in case of any add'l follow-up is needed.

Thanks,

Mike

Glenn Rice Review of Price Paper

Summary:

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Glenn

J. Michael Wright, ScD
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
National Center for Environmental Assessment
26 W. Martin Luther King Drive (MS-A110)
Cincinnati, OH 45268
513 569 7922 (phone)
513 487 2539 (fax)

From: Vandenberg, John
Sent: Friday, June 16, 2017 8:55 AM
To: Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer <Richmond-Bryant.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Bahadori, Tina <Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov>; Wright, Michael <Wright.Michael@epa.gov>; Segal, Deborah <Segal.Deborah@epa.gov>
Cc: D'Amico, Louis <DAmico.Louis@epa.gov>; Jones, Samantha <Jones.Samantha@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Reyes and Price paper

Jen,
I'll review as well in the next few days - please send along with Tech Ms Review forms, etc (the usual STICS entry).
Thanks
John

From: Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer
Sent: Friday, June 16, 2017 8:21 AM
To: Bahadori, Tina <Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov>; Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>; Wright, Michael <Wright.Michael@epa.gov>; Segal, Deborah <Segal.Deborah@epa.gov>
Cc: D'Amico, Louis <DAmico.Louis@epa.gov>; Jones, Samantha <Jones.Samantha@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Reyes and Price paper

Thank you, Tina. I will let Paul know right away that NCEA clearance is necessary. The push to get this paper out is that it is an HHRA Q3 key product. Since John is the RTP Division Director, I would imagine that it should go to him. Is there anyone else who will need to clear it before deciding if it should go to the NCEA IOAA?

John, would you be able to complete this clearance review in the next few days so that, if it has to go up to the NCEA IOAA, there will still be enough time to submit it by the end of the quarter?

Thanks very much to all of you for the time and thought you are putting into this process,
Jen

From: Bahadori, Tina
Sent: Friday, June 16, 2017 7:46 AM
To: Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer <Richmond-Bryant.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>; Wright, Michael <Wright.Michael@epa.gov>; Segal, Deborah <Segal.Deborah@epa.gov>

Cc: D'Amico, Louis <DAmico.Louis@epa.gov>; Jones, Samantha <Jones.Samantha@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: Reyes and Price paper

Thanks Jen. Someone at the division level needs to read the paper and either clear it there or flag it to the NCEA IOAA. Even though NERL is handling formal clearance, we still need to do our own due diligence – especially given the topic. I would love Mike's and Deb's impressions too, if they would like.

Tina

From: Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer

Sent: Thursday, June 15, 2017 4:57 PM

To: Bahadori, Tina <Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov>; D'Amico, Louis <DAmico.Louis@epa.gov>; Kenneke, John <Kenneke.John@epa.gov>; Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>; Wright, Michael <Wright.Michael@epa.gov>; Segal, Deborah <Segal.Deborah@epa.gov>; D'Amico, Louis <DAmico.Louis@epa.gov>; Jones, Samantha <Jones.Samantha@epa.gov>

Cc: Reyes, Jeanette <Reyes.Jeanette@epa.gov>; Price, PaulS <Price.PaulS@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: Reyes and Price paper

Hi everyone,

The Reyes and Price paper has cleared NERL and has been elevated to DC. Paul anticipates that the review will take about 2 weeks, so they have requested that any NCEA comments on the paper be returned to them by 6/26 so that they can make the Q3 deadline for this key product.

Thanks so much!

Jen

From: Bahadori, Tina

Sent: Wednesday, June 14, 2017 2:10 AM

To: Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer <Richmond-Bryant.Jennifer@epa.gov>

Cc: Reyes, Jeanette <Reyes.Jeanette@epa.gov>; Price, PaulS <Price.PaulS@epa.gov>; D'Amico, Louis <DAmico.Louis@epa.gov>; Kenneke, John <Kenneke.John@epa.gov>; Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>; Wright, Michael <Wright.Michael@epa.gov>; Segal, Deborah <Segal.Deborah@epa.gov>; D'Amico, Louis <DAmico.Louis@epa.gov>; Jones, Samantha <Jones.Samantha@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: Reyes and Price paper

Thanks Jen. I noticed that NERL also put it through Advanced Notification – it would be good to get some senior NCEA eyes on this as well, should Bruce have questions.

Tina

From: Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer

Sent: Tuesday, June 6, 2017 9:57 PM

To: Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>; Wright, Michael <Wright.Michael@epa.gov>; Segal, Deborah <Segal.Deborah@epa.gov>; D'Amico, Louis <DAmico.Louis@epa.gov>; Jones, Samantha <Jones.Samantha@epa.gov>; Bahadori, Tina <Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov>

Cc: Reyes, Jeanette <Reyes.Jeanette@epa.gov>; Price, PaulS <Price.PaulS@epa.gov>

Subject: Reyes and Price paper

Hi everyone,

Earlier today, you should have received a courtesy copy in STICS of Reyes et al., "An analysis of cumulative risks based on biomonitoring data for six phthalates using the Maximum Cumulative Ratio." This paper analyzed phthalate metabolite

data from NHANES to explore if cumulative risk was driven by exposure to multiple phthalates or by individual phthalate exposure. The study found that cumulative exposures to multiple phthalates posed a risk for a small proportion of the study participants, but risks for most were driven by single-phthalate exposure.

This work was performed by Jeanette Reyes (ORISE post-doc stationed in NCEA) and Paul Price (NERL) under HHRA Task 6.4 (3.234 - Apportioning Multimedia Exposure and Risk Across Human and Ecological Receptors), for which I am the task lead.

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

If you have any questions or concerns, please let me know and I will relay them to Paul and Jeanette.

Best wishes,
Jen

Jen Richmond-Bryant, Ph.D. | Senior Physical Scientist | National Center for Environmental Assessment | 109 TW Alexander Drive, MD B243-01, Research Triangle Park, NC | office: 919-541-4518 | mobile: 919-360-1466

Notice (if this communication regards a contract): This communication shall not be considered a change in scope (affecting LOE or Cost), which may only be issued by the Contract Officer (CO). If upon receipt the Contractor determines this communication to alter the scope, please contact myself or the CO for further instruction.